

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 078 331

CG 008 129

AUTHOR Johnson, Ralph H.; And Others
TITLE Evaluating Counselor Effectiveness Fact or Fallacy--Counselors Relate Equally Well to All Students.
INSTITUTION Minneapolis Public Schools, Minn. Dept. of Guidance Services.
PUB DATE 73
NOTE 13p.
EDRS PRICE MF-\$0.65 HC-\$3.29
DESCRIPTORS *Counseling Effectiveness; Counselor Evaluation; Counselor Performance; *Evaluation; Evaluation Techniques; Measurement Techniques; Minority Groups; Noncollege Preparatory Students; *Secondary School Students; *Student Attitudes; Student Needs; Student Opinion; Surveys

ABSTRACT

In order to investigate counselor effectiveness in urban secondary schools, guidance personnel developed a ninth grade and a twelfth grade Counseling Accountability Questionnaire. Data collected were processed for city-wide and individual school results. Items dealing with help received and the reaction of students to their relationship with counselors were tallied as to student responses by sex, race, achievement level, plans after high school, and the number of interactions with counselors. Results show two trends: (1) minority students responded more positively than others; and (2) noncollege-bound students responded more positively than college bound. Little consistent difference was evident based on sex and on achievement level. Implications of the resulting data include the following: (1) individual counseling programs can be studied from the students' point of views, (2) staff development programs for counselors can be more efficiently planned to meet student needs; and, (3) student priorities concerning counseling services can be readily identified. (Author/SES)

Minneapolis Public Schools
Department of Guidance Services

EVALUATING COUNSELOR EFFECTIVENESS

FACT OR FALLACY--COUNSELORS RELATE EQUALLY WELL TO ALL STUDENTS

Prepared by:

Donald M. Peterson - Counselor at Roosevelt High School
JoAnne M. Wilson - Counselor at Folwell Junior High School
Ralph H. Johnson - Director of Guidance Services

Problem and Hypotheses. In the spring of 1971 several Minneapolis counselors discussed ways to obtain feedback from students regarding counselor effectiveness. Counselors were also concerned about negative comments relating to their counseling services. Of particular consequence are remarks indicating that counselors were not relating consistently to all groups of students and that counselors were not available, knowledgeable, or helpful. To investigate counselor effectiveness in Minneapolis secondary schools, personnel in the Department of Guidance Services, with counselor input particularly from those who served as junior and senior high department chairmen, developed a Ninth Grade and a Twelfth Grade Counseling Accountability Questionnaire. The purpose of the administration of this questionnaire was to determine, through actual student response, how counseling effectiveness was viewed by students using the services.

The following hypotheses were formulated:

1. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statements regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to the number of student-counselor interviews.
2. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statement regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to the student's sex.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH,
EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF
EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

ED 078331

CG 008 129

3. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statements regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to student's race.
4. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statements regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to the student's post high school goal.
5. No significant difference exists in student response to questionnaire statements regarding counseling help received and counselor-student relationships as related to the student's school marks.

Design. The Counseling Accountability Questionnaires were administered in the spring of 1971 to 76 percent of the 9th grade students and a 22 percent sample of the 12th grade students in 25 of the 28 Minneapolis junior and senior high schools and in the spring of 1972 to over 80 percent of the 9th grade students and over 80 percent of the 12th grade students in 27 of the 28 Minneapolis junior and senior high schools (approximately 4,500 per class).

Minneapolis students in Grades 9 and 12 in the spring of 1971 and 1972 were asked to complete the Counseling Accountability Questionnaire. They did not sign their names but were asked to designate their sex, race, achievement level, plans after high school, and the number of times they had interacted with their counselors. Subjective comments were invited.

Data collected was processed for city-wide and individual school results. Items dealing with help received and reaction of students to their relationships with counselors were tallied as to student responses by sex, race, achievement level, plans after high school, and the number of times interacted with counselors.

Results. Representative graph results indicate that the criticisms and questions of counselor effectiveness that initiated this study were not borne out by the data. No significant difference was found to exist in student response to questionnaire statements for either grade 9 or grade 12 for either the 1971 or 1972 administration for any of the hypotheses with the exception of the first hypothesis. As the number of individual interviews increased, the responses were significantly more positive.

Although no significant difference was found for the other hypotheses, there was a trend evidenced from many questionnaire statements that minority students responded more positively than others and that noncollege-bound students responded more positively than the college bound. Little consistent difference was evident based on sex and on achievement level generally.

From the administration of these questionnaires and the resulting data came the following findings and implications:

1. Areas of strength and weakness for city-wide and each individual secondary school counseling program can be studied from the student's point of view.
2. Minority and non-college-bound students were as effectively served by counselors as the majority and college-bound students.
3. Staff development programs for counselors can be more efficiently planned to zero in on unmet student needs.
4. Priorities concerning counseling services as seen by students were identified.
5. Individual counselors can examine their effectiveness.
6. Item analysis of questionnaire item has implications for the delivery of guidance and counseling services.

(DATA SHOWN IN TABLES WERE ROUNDED TO THE NEAREST PERCENT)

1971

1972

	Interaction				Sex		Race		Goal		Interaction				Sex		Race		Goal	
	Yes	Didn't want or need	Wanted but didn't get	No response	Male	Female	White	Non-white	College	Non-College	Yes	Didn't want or need	Wanted but didn't get	No response	Male	Female	White	Non-white	College	Non-College
1. What subjects to take																				
Yes	53	21	31	50	55	52	53	56	47	59	58	35	40	53	59	58	59	61	56	61
Didn't want or need	40	74	60	43	40	39	40	37	45	45	35	55	50	41	31	35	36	30	39	33
Wanted but didn't get	06	05	09	07	03	07	06	04	07	02	05	08	08	05	04	05	04	07	04	05
No response	01	00	00	01	01	02	01	03	01	02	02	02	02	02	01	02	01	02	01	02
2. Get a program change																				
Yes	58	53	49	55	68	69	68	63	65	71	65	20	42	57	71	64	67	62	65	61
Didn't want or need	22	47	31	23	23	22	22	22	25	23	24	63	41	29	20	13	26	32	36	23
Wanted but didn't get	03	00	18	14	08	09	09	06	10	07	09	14	16	11	06	06	08	09	06	04
No response	01	00	02	01	01	00	01	03	00	02	02	02	01	03	05	02	02	02	02	05
3. See a college representative																				
Yes	18	00	07	12	20	16	16	33	30	07	19	04	06	12	21	16	12	40	31	07
Didn't want or need	72	79	73	72	71	74	76	52	62	82	72	92	83	79	70	56	73	72	61	82
Wanted but didn't get	07	21	16	03	07	07	06	10	07	07	05	02	08	05	04	05	05	04	05	04
No response	03	00	00	02	03	03	02	05	01	04	04	02	03	04	05	05	05	03	03	04
4. See a vocational-technical school representative																				
Yes	10	05	04	11	10	11	10	13	03	16	12	02	06	10	13	15	12	25	03	20
Didn't want or need	82	74	91	81	82	82	84	70	92	73	81	96	89	83	80	77	80	83	93	72
Wanted but didn't get	05	21	04	06	05	04	04	10	02	07	04	00	03	04	03	05	03	06	02	05
No response	03	00	00	02	03	03	02	07	02	04	03	02	03	03	04	04	03	05	03	03
5. Get information about a job or an apprenticeship																				
Yes	19	05	16	17	20	18	19	13	13	24	21	16	15	15	23	30	19	21	14	23
Didn't want or need	69	74	71	73	67	72	70	70	60	61	67	76	78	74	65	57	69	68	76	61
Wanted but didn't get	08	21	11	09	10	07	08	10	05	12	08	08	05	07	08	10	08	07	07	08
No response	04	00	02	02	02	03	03	07	02	03	03	00	02	03	04	03	03	05	03	05
6. Apply for admission to a college or vocational-technical school																				
Yes	51	00	24	42	56	49	50	59	72	77	51	06	15	46	59	60	52	51	76	51
Didn't want or need	41	71	42	44	39	42	43	32	32	37	43	86	74	43	35	24	42	43	19	62
Wanted but didn't get	05	21	13	07	04	06	06	04	05	06	04	06	06	04	04	03	11	07	04	03
No response	05	00	08	02	02	03	03	05	11	15	02	02	02	02	02	07	11	05	11	05

TABLE H - 3

(DATA FROM 12 EXPANDED IN PERCENTAGES ROUNDED TO THE NEAREST TENTH PERCENT)

	Interaction					Interaction					Interaction				
	Sex	Race	Age	Sex	Race	Sex	Race	Age	Sex	Race	Sex	Race	Age	Sex	Race
7. Apply for financial aid															
Yes	26	00	09	13	34	41	27	26	24	37	44	11	24	00	05
Didn't want or need	62	84	84	74	54	49	61	62	65	47	45	77	67	06	06
Asked but didn't get	08	16	07	11	07	07	09	03	08	12	09	08	04	02	02
No response	04	00	00	02	04	03	03	03	03	04	02	04	03	03	03
8. By arranging for me to attend a career or another important meeting															
Yes	15	00	02	09	16	27	17	15	15	16	14	16	14	06	04
Didn't want or need	76	79	84	84	75	67	74	77	77	67	31	73	78	32	88
Asked but didn't get	05	21	11	06	05	02	07	05	05	10	04	07	04	00	05
No response	04	00	02	02	04	03	03	03	03	07	01	04	04	02	03
9. Feel better about coming to school															
Yes	18	05	00	10	18	42	19	17	17	24	11	25	13	06	07
Didn't want or need	72	84	87	80	74	51	74	70	73	62	82	63	76	84	84
Asked but didn't get	07	11	11	08	04	04	04	09	07	09	05	09	06	12	06
No response	03	00	02	02	04	03	03	03	03	05	02	03	04	02	03
10. With a personal problem															
Yes	20	05	11	09	18	45	16	22	19	24	15	24	12	04	06
Didn't want or need	72	84	82	84	73	48	75	69	73	62	79	65	79	90	86
Asked but didn't get	05	11	04	05	03	03	04	05	05	04	03	06	05	04	05
No response	03	00	02	02	05	04	04	03	03	10	03	05	04	03	06
11. Learn about my abilities and interests															
Yes	21	05	27	23	33	52	30	32	31	37	27	35	21	14	18
Didn't want or need	57	79	67	66	55	40	60	55	53	48	64	52	61	71	69
Asked but didn't get	03	16	04	09	03	03	06	09	07	03	07	03	01	12	11
No response	04	00	02	02	05	05	03	04	04	07	02	05	03	02	01
12. Make an important decision															
Yes	21	11	20	22	33	50	32	29	29	38	29	32	27	10	17
Didn't want or need	59	74	73	70	56	41	60	52	61	49	63	56	64	72	71
Asked but didn't get	07	16	04	03	06	03	04	09	07	04	06	07	06	06	09
No response	03	00	00	01	05	03	03	04	03	09	02	05	04	02	03

NINTH GRADE

(DATA SHOWN IS BASED ON INTERVIEWS ROUNDED TO THE NEAREST WHOLE PERCENT)

1971

	Interaction	Sex	Race	Marks	Interaction	Sex	Race	Marks
1. Learn more about my abilities & interests								
Yes	38	15	31	46	39	38	38	44
Didn't want or need	52	69	60	46	52	52	53	43
Wanted but didn't get	07	09	07	07	07	07	05	11
No response	03	07	03	02	02	02	02	03
2. Think about my future education and career opportunities								
Yes	55	16	60	61	55	55	55	57
Didn't want or need	35	67	37	31	35	34	35	32
Wanted but didn't get	08	09	09	07	08	08	08	07
No response	02	07	02	01	02	02	02	04
3. Plan what subjects to take								
Yes	63	24	59	68	63	63	63	67
Didn't want or need	28	60	31	24	28	28	28	22
Wanted but didn't get	08	11	09	07	08	08	08	10
No response	01	05	01	01	01	01	01	01
4. Get a program change								
Yes	43	13	34	51	43	42	42	47
Didn't want or need	40	74	50	32	39	42	41	32
Wanted but didn't get	14	05	12	15	14	13	13	14
No response	03	07	04	03	04	03	04	07
5. Learn about or participate in something special								
Yes	25	11	15	32	22	27	24	36
Didn't want or need	65	73	75	58	67	64	67	53
Wanted but didn't get	07	09	06	07	07	07	07	07
No response	03	07	03	03	03	03	02	04
6. Interact now to get along better with others								
Yes	12	06	07	16	13	11	11	20
Didn't want or need	82	84	86	78	82	84	84	73
Wanted but didn't get	03	02	03	03	03	03	03	04
No response	03	07	02	02	02	02	02	03
7. Be helpful to others under-stand the center								
Yes	03	02	04	11	08	08	07	13
Didn't want or need	34	36	88	81	34	34	35	76
Wanted but didn't get	04	03	04	05	04	05	04	07
No response	04	07	03	03	03	03	03	03

NINTH GRADE

(DATA SECTION IS EXPRESSED IN PERCENTAGES ROUNDED TO THE NEAREST WHOLE PERCENT)

Interaction	Sex	Race	Grade	Interaction	Sex	Race	Grade
15. Listen to me				16. Is a person I enjoy talking with			
Yes	78	23	71	Yes	56	15	44
No	07	07	09	No	19	16	22
Don't know	13	67	19	Don't know	23	67	32
No response	02	02	01	No response	02	02	01
17. Knows what he's talking about				18. Has visited my classroom			
Yes	70	30	64	Yes	57	55	59
No	08	07	08	No	20	24	31
Don't know	20	62	26	Don't know	09	19	09
No response	02	01	02	No response	02	01	01
19. Has involved me in group counseling sessions				20. Has talked with my parents			
Yes	12	04	07	Yes	22	13	16
No	79	72	83	No	57	56	63
Don't know	08	21	03	Don't know	16	20	14
No response	01	02	01	No response	01	01	01
1971				1972			
Total	3640	94	1512	Total	3530	32	118
Never				Once			
1 - 3				2 - 3			
4 - 10+				4 - 10+			
Male				Male			
Female				Female			
White				White			
Non-white				Non-white			
A & B				A & B			
C				C			
D & E				D & E			
1971				1972			
Total				Total			
Never				Once			
2 - 3				2 - 3			
4 - 10+				4 - 10+			
Male				Male			
Female				Female			
White				White			
Non-white				Non-white			
A & B				A & B			
C				C			
D & E				D & E			

MINNEAPOLIS PUBLIC SCHOOLS
Department of Guidance Services

JUNIOR HIGH QUESTIONNAIRE

To the student:

The counseling department is interested in knowing how students feel about the junior high counseling program. It will be helpful if you answer as thoughtfully and as honestly as possible the questionnaire on the back.

Since individual students will not be identified, do not put your name on your paper. If you object to answering a question you may skip it.

Check only one answer for each question.

To provide your counselor with information about student feelings, please identify your present counselor according to the code given you. (Omit this item if you do not get special instructions.)

____ 1.
____ 2.
____ 3.

____ 4.
____ 5.
____ 6.

School (71-73) Grade (26-27)

Listed below are some ways that counselors can be helpful. For each item, check the one column that best describes your contact with your counselors in Grades 7, 8 and 9.

MY COUNSELOR HELPED ME	Yes, My Counselor Helped Me	I Didn't Want or Need Help In This Area	I Wanted Help, But Didn't Get It
1. Learn more about my abilities and interests	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
2. Think about my future education and career opportunities	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
3. Plan what subjects to take	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
4. Get a program change	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
5. Learn about or participate in something special (WOC, WECEP, CAMP, NYC, Urban Arts, Talented Youth, Summer School, a meeting)	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
6. Understand how to get along better with classmates or teachers or family	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
7. By helping classmates or teachers or family understand me better	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
8. With a personal problem	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
9. Make an important decision	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
10. Contact a person who could help me	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
11. Feel better about coming to school	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____

For each of the following phrases, check the column that best describes your present counselor. Your choices are Yes, No, and Don't Know. (Check only one answer for each item).

MY COUNSELOR	YES	NO	Don't Know
12. Cares about me	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
13. Is a person I can trust	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
14. Is easy to get in to see	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
15. Listens to me	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
16. Is a person I enjoy talking with	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
17. Knows what he is talking about	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
18. Has visited my classes	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
19. Has involved me in group counseling sessions	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
20. Has talked with my parents	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
21. How many times have you "talked" with a counselor during junior high? (Include seventh and eighth grade even if you had a different counselor)			
1. Never			
2. Once			
3. 2-3 times			
4. 4-9 times			
5. Ten or more times			
22. What is your sex?			
1. Male			
2. Female			
23. What is your race?			
1. Black American			
2. American Indian			
3. Spanish Surnamed American			
4. Oriental American			
5. White American			
6. Other			
24. Which of the following best describes the average grades you get in school?			
1. A			
2. B			
3. C			
4. D			
5. F			
25. If you have any additional comments, please write them in the blank space at the bottom of the other side of this sheet.			

MINNEAPOLIS PUBLIC SCHOOLS
Department of Guidance Services
SENIOR HIGH QUESTIONNAIRE

To the student:

Please think about the counselor or counselors that you have had during tenth, eleventh and twelfth grades as you answer the questionnaire on the back. It will be helpful to your school if you will answer as thoughtfully and as honestly as possible.

Since individual students will not be identified, do not put your name on your paper. If you object to answering a question you may skip it.

Check only one answer for each question.

To provide your counselor with information about student feelings, please identify your present counselor according to the code given you. (Omit this item if you do not get special instructions.)

____ 1.
____ 2.
____ 3.

____ 4.
____ 5.
____ 6.

School _____ (71-73) Grade _____ (26-27)

Listed below are some ways that counselors can be helpful. For each item check the column that best describes your contact with your counselor.

MY COUNSELOR HELPED ME	Yes, My Counselor Helped Me	I Didn't Want or Need Help In This Area	I Wanted Help, But Didn't Get It
1. Plan what subjects to take	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
2. Get a program change	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
3. See a college representative	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
4. See a vocational-technical school representative	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
5. Get information about a job or an apprenticeship	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
6. Apply for admission to college or vocational-technical school	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
7. Apply for financial aid (Scholarship)	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
8. By arranging for me to attend a career or another important meeting	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
9. Feel better about coming to school	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
10. With a personal problem	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
11. Learn about my abilities and interests	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
12. Make an important decision	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
13. Get along better with classmates or teachers or family	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____

For each of the following phrases, check the column that best describes your present counselor. Your choices are Yes, No, and Don't Know.

MY COUNSELOR	YES	NO	Don't Know
14. Is a person I can trust	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
15. Listens to me	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
16. Helps me learn to make my own decisions	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
17. Is easy to get in to see	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
18. Knows what he's talking about	(1) _____	(2) _____	(3) _____
19. How many times have you "talked" with your counselor during the school year 1971-72?			
1. Never			
2. Once			
3. 2-3 times			
4. 4-9 times			
5. Ten or more times			
20. What is your sex?			
1. Male			
2. Female			
21. What is your race?			
1. Black American			
2. American Indian			
3. Spanish Surnamed American			
4. Oriental American			
5. White American			
6. Other			
22. Which of the following best describes the grades you get in school?			
1. A			
2. B			
3. C			
4. D			
5. F			
23. What do you plan to do next year?			
1. Full-time job			
2. Military service			
3. Technical, vocational or business school			
4. College			
5. Other			
24. If you have any additional comments please write them in the blank space at the bottom of the other side of this sheet.			